

Comment to “Coverage by Randomly Deployed Wireless Sensor Networks”.

by

Bhupendra Gupta ¹
Faculty of Engineering and Sciences,
Indian Institute of Information Technology
(DM)-Jabalpur-482011, India.

1 Introduction.

In the above paper, Lemma (4), on page 2659 play the key role for deriving the main results in the paper. The statement as well as the proof of Lemma (4), page 2659, [1] is not correct. Here mainly two serious errors in this Lemma, one is in the statement of lemma and the other one in the proof of Lemma (4), on page 2666, [1]. In the Lemma (4), page 2659, [1], Wan and Yi, states the lemma as follows,

Lemma 1.1 *Assume Ω is the disk region and let r_n be such that $n\pi r_n^2 \rightarrow \infty$ and $n\pi r_n^3 \rightarrow 0$. Then for any point $z \in \delta\Omega$*

$$\phi_{n,r_n}(z) \sim \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^k}{k!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}}. \quad (1.1)$$

Firstly the statement of Lemma (4), page 2659, [1], is wrong. Since authors has taken $n\pi r_n^2 \rightarrow \infty$. This implies

$$\phi_{n,r_n}(z) \rightarrow 0,$$

because in the right hand side of (1.1), $n\pi r_n^2$ is in the negative power of exponential.

¹Corresponding Author, email: bhupen@iiitdm.in, gupta.bhupendra@gmail.com

Hence authors should remove the condition $n\pi r_n^2 \rightarrow \infty$, from the statement of Lemma (1.2) (Lemma (4), page 2659, [1]).

Now the second and more serious error is in the proof of Lemma (4), on page 2666, [1]. Here authors has derive the lower bound of $\phi(z)$ as follows

$$\phi(z) \geq \sum_{i=0}^k \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^i}{i!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}} > \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^k}{k!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}}. \quad (1.2)$$

By using the second inequality, authors were getting lose lower bound, while the objective of the lemma is to get the exact expression for $\phi(z)$.

Also, authors has given the proof for the upper bound of $\phi(z)$ as follows

$$\begin{aligned} \phi(z) &\leq \sum_{i=0}^k \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^i}{i!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2} + nr^2 \arcsin \frac{\sqrt{\pi}r}{2}} \\ &= \left(\sum_{i=0}^k \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^i}{i!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}} \right) e^{nr^2 \arcsin \frac{\sqrt{\pi}r}{2}} \\ &\sim \sum_{i=0}^k \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^i}{i!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}} \sim \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^k}{k!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}} \end{aligned}$$

The problem is with the last ‘ $\sim$ ’ in the above expression.

From (1.2), we have

$$\sum_{i=0}^k \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^i}{i!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}} > \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^k}{k!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}}.$$

It is clear that one can not replace ‘ $a > b$ ’ by ‘ $a \sim b$.’ Even in case of clear convergence i.e., $a \rightarrow b$, here it is not allowed, because the authors were giving the derivation of upper bound for $\phi(z)$ and $\frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^k}{k!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}}$ is the

lower bound of $\sum_{i=0}^k \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^i}{i!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}}$.

Following is the corrected version of Lemma (4).

Lemma 1.2 *Assume Ω is the disk region and let r_n be such that $n\pi r_n^3 \rightarrow 0$. Then for any point $z \in \delta\Omega$*

$$\sum_{i=1}^k \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^i}{i!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}} \leq \phi_{n,r_n}(z) \leq (1+C) \sum_{i=1}^k \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^i}{i!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}}, \quad (1.3)$$

where $C > 0$ is an arbitrary constant.

Proof. The idea of the proof is same, except the mathematics for getting the bounds of $\phi(z)$, which leads to totally different bounds. Here we are giving only those steps which are different from the original proof.

For the lower bound

$$\phi(z) \geq \sum_{i=1}^k \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^i}{i!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}}.$$

Now for the upper bound

$$\begin{aligned} \phi(z) &\leq \sum_{i=0}^k \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^i}{i!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2} + nr^2 \arcsin \frac{\sqrt{\pi}r}{2}} \\ &= \left(\sum_{i=0}^k \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^i}{i!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}} \right) e^{nr^2 \arcsin \frac{\sqrt{\pi}r}{2}} \\ &\leq (1+C) \sum_{i=0}^k \frac{\left(\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}\right)^i}{i!} e^{-\frac{n\pi r_n^2}{2}}, \end{aligned}$$

since $nr^2 \arcsin \frac{\sqrt{\pi}r}{2} = \frac{1}{2}n\pi^{1/2}r^3 + \frac{1}{2^{3/2}}n\pi^{3/2}r^5 + \dots$, and $n\pi r_n^3 \rightarrow 0$.

This change in Lemma leads a drastic change in all the result derived in the article [1].

References

- [1] P.J. Wan and C.W. Yi, "Coverage by Randomly Deployed Wireless Sensor Networks", IEEE Transaction On Information Theory, vol.52, No.6, June 2006.